

Minutes of Meeting of the **Pravesh Niyran Samiti (Medical Education)** held under the **Chairmanship of Justice D.K. Deshmukh (Retd.)** on Thursday, the **15th October, 2015 at 12:00 p.m.** in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, 4th floor, Government Dental College Building, St. Georges Hospital Campus, Near CST, Fort, Mumbai - 400 001

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Dr. Ravi Bapat : Member
2. Dr. M.S. Kekre : Member
3. Mrs. Medha Gadgil : Member Secretary and Addl. Chief Secretary, Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra.

Dr. Arun Jamkar, Member was unable to attend the meeting.

Shri N.K. Deshmukh, I.A.S. Office Secretary (holding additional charge) of Pravesh Niyran Samiti, Mumbai was absent. However, Mrs. K.V. Sane. Desk Officer, Pravesh Niyran Samiti, Mumbai represented the office and Pravesh Niyran Samiti, Mumbai.

Invitees:

- 1) Mrs. Anjali Ambhire : Dy. Secretary, Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra
- 2) Dr. P.H. Shingare : Director, Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State

Special Invitee:

- 1) Shri P.E. Gaikwad, I.A.S. (Retd.) : Ex. Office Secretary, Pravesh Niyran Samiti, Mumbai

Copies of Agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

(Handwritten signature)

Item No. 1: To approve and confirm Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantran Samiti (Medical Education) held on Thursday, the 29th September 2015 in the Conference Hall office of the Regional Center, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai.

Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantran Samiti - Medical Education held on Thursday, the 29th September 2015 in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai - 400 001 are approved and confirmed, subject to following modifications/corrections.

A) Item No. 7(c) para no. 2 to be read as under :-

After deliberation, Samiti accede to the request made by colleges to admit the students from other CET i.e. MH-CET-2015, ASSO-CET-2015 and AIPMT-2015 for the admissions of first year B.P.Th. course for Academic Year 2015-16. Samiti further decides that the approval of such students will be given only after submission of sufficient evidence *as to the list of qualified students in ASSO-CET-2015 having been exhausted fully for Academic Year 2015-16 for First Year B.P.Th. course by the Competent authority, Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical & Dental Colleges of Maharashtra before the admission.*

Instead of ...

After deliberation, Samiti accede to the request made by colleges to admit the students from other CET i.e. MH-CET-2015, ASSO-CET-2015 and AIPMT-2015 for the admissions of first year B.P.Th. course for Academic Year 2015-16. Samiti further decides that the approval of such admitted students will be given only after submitting sufficient evidence as to the list of qualified students in ASSO-CET-2015 having been exhausted fully for Academic Year 2015-16. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 2: To review action taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meetings.

Samiti perused the action taken report on the decisions arrived at in its previous meeting held on Thursday, the 29th September 2015 details of which are as below:-

Meeting of 29 th Sept. 2015	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No.1	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti dated 29 th September 2015.	Minutes of Meeting are displayed on the Website and Notice Board of the Samiti on 8/10/2015.

Samiti noted and approved the action of the office.

DW

Item No. 3: To consider and decide on replies submitted by the Colleges/Institutes as per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 15th September 2015 - at Item No. 3

And

Item No. 4: To consider and decide the following objections/representations received from the students/parents in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 15th September 2015 - at Item No. 3.

- a) **Letter dated 8th September 2015 received from Supriya Margale**
- b) **Letter dated 26/09/2015 received from Almas Quraishi and Ors.**
- c) **Email dated 28th September 2015 received from Ram Mankekar**
- d) **Letter dated 26th September 2015 received from Mohd. M. Nadvi**
- e) **Email dated 28th September 2015 received from Prof. Shantanu Kale**
- f) **Email dated 24th September 2015 received from Ajay Shah.**

Samiti perused the following replies submitted by the Colleges/Institutes as per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 15th September 2015 (at Item No. 3).

- i) Letter dated 28th September 2015 received from Terna Medical College & Hospital, Nerul, Navi Mumbai.
- ii) Letter dated 28th September 2015 received from MIMER, Medical College, Talegaon Dabhade, Pune.
- iii) Letter dated 5th October 2015 received from Dr. Vasantrao Pawar Medical College, Nashik.
- iv) Letter dated 8th October 2015 received from NKP Salve Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Nagpur.
- v) Letter dated 29th October 2015 received from Smt Kashibai Navale Medical College, Narhe, Pune.
- vi) Letter dated 29th September 2015 received from Godavari Foundation's Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College Jalgaonl.

DU

- vii) Letter dated 28th September 2015 received from Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Khatav, Satara.
- viii) Letter dated 28th September 2015 received from Ashwini Rural Medical College & Hospital, Solapur.
- ix) Letter dated 24th September 2015 received from M G V's KBH Dental College & Hospital, Nashik.
- x) Letter dated 29th September 2015 received from Y.M.T. Dental College, Navi Mumbai
- xi) Letter dated 28th September 2015 received from Terna Dental College & Hospital, Navi Mumbai.
- xii) Letters dated 28th & 29th September 2015 received from Sinhgad Dental College, Pune.
- xiii) Letter dated 29th September 2015 received from Shivtej Arogya Seva Snastha Yogita Dental College & Hospital.

The Samiti received several complaints from students in relation to admissions to Private Unaided Medical and Dental Colleges during the year 2012-13 that a large number of illegalities have been committed while admitting students in post second CAP round admissions. The State Government had also appointed Committees to hold the enquiry. Reports of those Committees were placed before the Samiti. Those reports were considered by the Samiti in its meeting held on 4th January 2013 and the Committee decided to issue Show Cause Notice to the following colleges "to show cause (as to why Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti should not confirm the findings of the said Committees and initiate appropriate action including non approval of admissions after second round of ASSO – CET 2012/MH-CET 2012 in the colleges, institutes concerned". Replies were received from the following Colleges.

Sr. No.	Name of the College/Institute
1	Terna Medical College & Hospital, Nerul, Navi Mumbai
2	MIMER, Medical College, Talegaon Dabhade, Pune
3	Dr. Vasantrao Pawar Medical College, Nashik
4	A.C.P.M. Medical College, Dhule
5	NKP Salve Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Nagpur
6	Dr.Punjabrao Deshmukh Memorial Medical College, Amravati
7	Padmashri Dr. Vithalrao Vikhe Patil Medical College, Ahmednagar
8	Smt Kashibai Navale Medical College, Narhe, Pune
9	Godavari Foundation's Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College Jalgaon
10	Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Khatav, Satara
11	Ashwini Rural Medical College & Hospital, Solapur
12	M G V's KBH Dental College & Hospital, Nashik
13	Y.M.T. Dental College, Navi Mumbai

20

Sr. No.	Name of the College/Institute
14	Terna Dental College & Hospital, Navi Mumbai
15	Mahatma Gandhi Missions Dental College, Navi Mumbai
16	Sinhgad Dental College, Pune
17	Shivtej Arogya Seva Snastha Yogita Dental College & Hospital

Samiti considered the replies in its meeting held on 11th January 2013 and found that the following institutions had admitted number of students as mentioned against the names of each institute irregularly and illegally without following the laid down rules, procedures, and norms etc. resulting in denial of admissions to the meritorious students.

Sr. No.	Name of College	No. of admissions done by flouting norms, rules, procedures etc.
1	Terna Medical College & Hospital, Nerul, Navi Mumbai	10
2	MIMER, Medical College, Talegaon Dabhade, Pune	6
3	Dr. Vasant Rao Pawar Medical College, Nashik	9
4	NKP Salve Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Nagpur	11
5	Smt Kashibai Navale Medical College, Narhe, Pune	7
6	Godavari Foundation's Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College Jalgaon	19
7	Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Khatav, Satara	38
8	Ashwini Rural Medical College & Hospital, Solapur	7
9	M G V's KBH Dental College & Hospital, Nashik	16
10	Y.M.T. Dental College, Navi Mumbai	17
11	Terna Dental College & Hospital, Navi Mumbai	18
12	Sinhgad Dental College, Pune	35
13	Shivtej Arogya Seva Snastha Yogita Dental College & Hospital	13
	Total :	206

Samiti therefore concluded that the process of admission conducted by these institutions was not fair, transparent and merit based and that reservation rules were not followed. Samiti therefore decided to disapprove the admission of the students which were made by flouting rules, norms, procedure etc. by these institutions. Samiti hence recommended to the State Government to direct the concerned Colleges / Institutions to cancel these admissions which were not approved by Samiti. It was also suggested to State Government to move the Hon'ble Supreme Court and seek appropriate orders so that the resultant vacancies could be filled in.

aw

Against this decision, Writ petitions were filed in the Hon'ble High Court by students whose admissions were disapproved. Petitions were also filed by following seven intuitions out of total thirteen institutions involved challenging the decision of the Samiti.

Sr. no.	Name of the College
1.	Smt Kashibai Navale Medical College, Narhe, Pune
2.	Sinhgad Dental College, Pune
3.	Ashwini Rural Medical College & Hospital, Solapur
4.	Dr. Vasantrao Pawar Medical College, Nashik
5.	Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Khatav, Satara
6.	M G V's KBH Dental College & Hospital, Nashik
7.	Terna Dental College & Hospital, Navi Mumbai

Writ Petitions were also filed by students who were denied admissions because of illegal and irregular admissions by the institutions. In the petitions filed by the student whose admissions were disapproved, Hon'ble High Court passed the interim order as a consequence of which directions were issued to the University permitting those students to prosecute their further studies for the course of MBBS / BDS. The Writ Petitions filed by the students who were denied admissions were dismissed by the Hon'ble High Court. In so far as the Petitions filed by the Institutions are concerned, there is no interim or final order made by Hon'ble High Court, the Petitions are however pending before Hon'ble High Court of Judicature at Bombay.

Against the order of Hon'ble High Court, dismissing the petitions filed by the students who were denied admissions, Special Leave Petitions (C) Nos. 31900 of 2013 was filed before the Hon'ble Supreme Court which was disposed of by an order dated 2nd September 2014. (Krina Ajay Shah & Ors. Vs. Secretary Association of Management of Unaided Private Medial & Dental Colleges, Maharashtra & Ors.) By the judgment of the Hon'ble Supreme Court, in Krina Ajay Shah's cases, Hon'ble Supreme Court held that the grievance of the Petitioners before the Hon'ble Supreme Court that they were illegally denied admission by these institutions is established and it is fully justified. The Hon'ble Supreme Court by that judgment directed the State Government to pay public law damages to the students.

The Petitions filed by the students whose admissions were disapproved in the meantime continued to remain pending in Hon'ble High Court and because of the interim order passed by the Hon'ble High Court, of Judicature at Bombay those students continued to prosecute their further studies. In this situation a letter dated 2nd September 2015 was received by Samiti from the State Government. The letter stated basically that though the Samiti held that the admissions given by the Institutions to the students whose admissions have been disapproved were illegal because of the interim order passed by Hon'ble High Court, of Judicature at Bombay the students continued to prosecute their studies and presently they are in the third year of their course. Seats occupied by those students even if they become vacant are incapable of being filled in. Therefore, it was stated on behalf of Government, that in this background, Samiti needs to reconsider its earlier decision of disapproving the admissions of these students and take a suitable decision enabling these students to complete their respective courses.

dw

Samiti considered the contents of the letter in its meeting held on 15th September 2015 and after detailed deliberations over the factual position put forth before the Samiti, Samiti decided "As a one time measure, to request the Maharashtra University for Health Science, Nashik to treat these admissions as having been approved by Samiti and accordingly process the examination form of the students". By the same resolution, Samiti also decided to issue show cause notices to the institutions who had illegally admitted these students asking them to show cause as to why heavy penalties should not be levied for the wrongful admissions of these students. Pursuant to the Show Cause Notice issued by the Samiti, the Institutions have submitted their explanations.

- 1) Perusal of the explanations submitted by these Institutions show that most of the Institutions have contended that the admissions which were disapproved by Samiti of the students were not really wrongful. Samiti has already taken a decision that the admissions were illegally granted. Out of 13 Institutions, 6 Institutions have not even challenged that decision and 7 Institutions who have challenged that decision, there is no interim order passed by the Hon'ble High Court at Judicature at Bombay. Therefore with this situation, so far as this Samiti is concerned, there is no question of again making an enquiry whether the admissions were wrongful or not.
- 2) Some of the Institutions contended that though Samiti decided that the admissions were illegally made, there is no adjudication of this issue by any court though petitions filed by some Institutions are pending in the Hon'ble High Court. Samiti does not find any substance in these contentions. In the Special Leave Petition which is decided by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in Krina Ajay Shah's case, the Association of these Institutions was a party and in that judgment the Hon'ble Supreme Court has considered the issue whether the students who were the Petitioners before the Hon'ble Supreme Court were unfairly denied admissions. The question whether those students are unfairly denied admissions cannot be considered without first considering the question that the students who have been admitted in their place have been illegally admitted. Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in that judgment has clearly recorded a finding "In the light of the above mentioned factual situation, it is established that the grievance of the Petitioners herein is fully justified". The grievance of the Petitioners before the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India was that they were illegally denied admission. Therefore, it can be said that the Hon'ble Supreme Court has held that denial of admission to those students was not fair and proper. In any case, Samiti by its resolution dated 11th January 2013 has already said that these Institutions have illegally made admissions. At that time, question of imposing penalty on these Institutions was not considered because the admissions were disapproved and an attempt was to be made at that juncture to cancel these admissions and give admissions to the students who were rightfully entitled to the admission. However due to passage of time, that could not happen. Therefore, now the students who were not really entitled to admissions are continued. Only these Institutions are really responsible for this situation. In this situation, it is clear that Samiti is duty bound to impose the appropriate penalty on these Institutions. As far as the amount of penalty to be levied is concerned, it is to be seen that the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in Krina Shah's case has awarded public law damages @ Rs.20 lakhs for each of the

rw

Petitioners before the Hon'ble Supreme Court who was denied admission because of the illegal actions of these Institutions. **Samiti therefore resolves that these Institutions should be directed to pay penalties at the rate of Rs.20 lakhs per student wrongly/illegally admitted by them.** List of the Institutions, of students wrongly and illegally admitted by them and the amount of penalty payable by them is thus as under-

1) Terna Medical College, Navi Mumbai - Amount of penalty to be paid by the institute – Rs. 2,00,00,000/-

Sr. No.	Name of the Student illegally /Wrongly admitted
1.	Chokshi Aishwarya Niraj
2.	Bhindarwala Burhanuddin Kutbuddin
3.	Gwalani Ria Tulsio
4.	Shaikh Sarfraj Sirtaj
5.	Kulkarni Prajakta Ananta
6.	Anjaria Paras Devendra
7.	Sehal Anisha Shah
8.	Makhija Amay Shashikant
9.	Pradhan Kalyani Vinod
10.	Admane Karan Sunil

2. MIMER, Medical College, Talegaon Dabhade, Pune - Amount of penalty to be paid by the institute – Rs. 1,20,00,000/-

Sr. No.	Name of the Student illegally /Wrongly admitted
1.	Shruti Ravinarayan
2.	Vyas Medha Atul
3.	Ghatge Sayali Eknath
4.	Waghmare Vishnu Laxman
5.	Tembhurne Snehal Dilip
6.	Wadate Sushantak Suresh

aw

3) **Smt. Kashibai Navale Medical College, Pune - Amount of penalty to be paid by the institute – Rs. 1,40,00,000/-**

Sr. No.	Name of the Student illegally /Wrongly admitted
1.	Patanwala Abbas Fazal
2.	Pandya Sashmi Bharat
3.	Rao Aditi Loknath
4.	Pathak Ridhi Kaushal
5.	Samanta Ravina Gopal
6.	Ahire Snehal Subhash
7.	Borle Abhishek Suhas

4) **Dr. Vasantrao Pavar Medical College, Nashik - Amount of penalty to be paid by the institute – Rs. 1,80,00,000/-**

Sr. No.	Name of the Student illegally /Wrongly admitted
1.	Totala Yashwardhan
2.	Jadwani Ankit Mahesh
3.	Sayyed Azhar Sayyed Anis
4.	Devdikar Shrutik Nandkumar
5.	Shekha Tufayl Ahmed Mohmd.
6.	Patil Sanket Purushottam
7.	Somani Nandan Rakesh
8.	Negi Richa Madansingh
9.	Sharma Bharat

5) **Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College, Jalgaon - Amount of penalty to be paid by the institute – Rs. 3,80,00,000/-**

Sr. No.	Name of the Student illegally /Wrongly admitted
1.	Sheikh Zaid Khalid Ahmed
2.	Kale Manesh Uddhav
3.	Tichkule Pratiksha Ganpat
4.	Sanghavi Jidnyasa Kamalkishor

20

Sr. No.	Name of the Student illegally /Wrongly admitted
5.	Padole Nihal Mohan
6.	Kulkarni Gargi Eknath
7.	Mapari Hemant Bhagwat
8.	Tekale Shubhangi Vijay
9.	Chavan Shreeprasad Fattesingh
10.	Ashmira Zainab Mushir Patel
11.	Puri Akash Shivshankar
12.	Shinde Pranoti Popatrao
13.	Lahoti Shraddha Hemraj
14.	Patil Mahesh Ramesh
15.	Meshram Arzoo Prakash
16.	Ughade Aniket Abhimanyu
17.	Sakhare Gaurav Dilip
18.	Chaudhari Abhishek Dipak
19.	Naik Ajinkya Raju

**6) N.K.P. Salve Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Nagpur -
Amount of penalty to be paid by the institute – Rs. 2,20,00,000/**

Sr. No.	Name of the Student illegally /Wrongly admitted
1.	Pankhuri Tembhune
2.	Choudhari Shubham Umesh
3.	Malvia Juhi Anil
4.	Mukharji Apurva Arun
5.	Aditya Kumar Mishra
6.	Savij Kaivlya Rajendra
7.	Khandtar Aishwarya Vasant
8.	Mankar Abhishek Sushil
9.	Vaychal Radha Prashant
10.	Kandelwal Ruchit Raju
11.	Rishabh Gupta

bw

7) **Ashwini Rural Medical College, Solapur - Amount of penalty to be paid by the institute – Rs. 1,40,00,000/**

Sr. No.	Name of the Student illegally /Wrongly admitted
1.	Mohit Laxmikant Marda
2.	Shradha Satish Niture
3.	Shraddha Rajendra Borhade
4.	Divaya Satish Sadigale
5.	Sangram Ramchandra Vanage
6.	Laxmi Sunil Bali
7.	Mayur Nagnath Gangasagare

8) **Institute of Medical Sciences, Mayani, Satara - Amount of penalty to be paid by the institute – Rs. 7,60,00,000/**

Sr. No.	Name of the Student illegally /Wrongly admitted
1.	Vaibhav Sanjay Agarkar
2.	Mrunali Machhindra Autade
3.	Ashwin Madhukar Burude
4.	Aishwarya Gajanan Gavai
5.	Rupali Lalasaheb Ghatage
6.	Sharad Rajendra Giri
7.	Tushar Rajendra Havale
8.	Prerna Prakash Jadhav
9.	Prasad Mahendra Jain
10.	Kadari Sayyad Masud
11.	Amol Kalyanrao Kaluse
12.	Rachana Nandkumar Karjage
13.	Smruti Shashikant kumbhar
14.	Mohd. Qashid Khokar
15.	Sandip Digamber Mohite
16.	Mujumdar Harshwardhan Ninad
17.	Kranti Balaji Mundhe

BD

Sr. No.	Name of the Student illegally /Wrongly admitted
18.	Tejal Ramesh Mungase
19.	Kiran Baburao Nafte
20.	Dipika Yashwant Nirwan
21.	Aishwarya Umesh Parekh
22.	Shubham Badal Petkar
23.	Ajinkya Laxman Pingale
24.	Ajinkya Sunil Pustake
25.	Lekha Bhupendra Rathod
26.	Sharad Narsing Rathod
27.	Aishwarya Sunil Satardekar
28.	Amol Vinod Satav
29.	Aishwarya Sanjay Shinde
30.	Keshav Suryakant Shinde
31.	Prajakta Shashikant Shinde
32.	Sainath Raghunath Shinde
33.	Isteyak Akhlaque Siddiqui
34.	Priyanka Prakash Sonwane
35.	Pradnya Sunil Sonawane
36.	Nidhi Dipak Tibude
37.	Siddhi Prabhakar Wast
38.	Nakul Shantilal Mutha

9) **Y.M.T. Dental College, Navi Mumbai - Amount of penalty to be paid by the institute – Rs. 3,40,00,000/-**

Sr. No.	Name of the Student illegally /Wrongly admitted
1.	Gokhale Sanika Sunil
2.	Mhatre Apoorva Ajit
3.	Thakkar Purvang Vipin
4.	Jadhav Komal Sanjay
5.	Pinge Siddharth Shirang

Handwritten mark

Sr. No.	Name of the Student illegally /Wrongly admitted
6.	Naik Prajakta Vinod
7.	Golwala Mihir Chetan
8.	Gurnani Heenal Narayan
9.	Vyas Virali Chandresh
10.	Mulla Mariam Mohammed Ibrahim
11.	Modi Avni Naresh
12.	Pasi Aayushi Ramdhari
13.	Murudkar Shruti Sanjay
14.	Sahu Sonu Devesh
15.	Patil Tanvi Sanjay
16.	Jain Sonali Babulal
17.	Jacinto Eric Gilory

10) Terna Dental College, Navi Mumbai - Amount of penalty to be paid by the institute – Rs. 3,60,00,000/-

Sr. No.	Name of the Student illegally /Wrongly admitted
1.	Gindra Kunal Satish
2.	Gupta Ravi Banwarilal
3.	Deshmukh Farheen Jahan Ab Rab
4.	Mohammednafis Mohammedsharif
5.	Shaikh Fatima Zuhara Abdul Rehman
6.	Sawant Kshipra Anil
7.	Indikar Tanzila Maqsood Ahamed
8.	Joshi Aishwarya Sanjiv
9.	Sawant Aishwarya Sunil
10.	Shah Abhisri Mayur
11.	Nandgaonkar Vaibhavi Pandurang
12.	Modi Janhavi Dhaval
13.	Pinto Simone Gerard
14.	Shaikh Najis Rehmatulla

20

Sr. No.	Name of the Student illegally /Wrongly admitted
15.	Naik Sneha Sunil
16.	Nikam Latika Ashok
17.	Sonawane Aishwarya Anupam
18.	Jadhav Pratik Vijay

11) Yogita Dental College, Khed, Ratnagiri - Amount of penalty to be paid by the institute – Rs. 2,60,00,000/-

Sr. No.	Name of the Student illegally /Wrongly admitted
1.	Barve Chaitali Vijay
2.	Kudalkar Vardha Narendra
3.	Valam Supriya Pandurang
4.	Khadse Aishwariya Rajendra
5.	Patil Pooja Pratap
6.	Sawant Divya Sunil
7.	Reelkar Tanvi Ashok
8.	Chande Samrudhi Sadanand
9.	Sagvekar Yogesh Rajesh
10.	Shrevale Shradha Ramesh
11.	Salaskar Reemika Rajendra
12.	Masurkar Saili Santosh
13.	Salvi Shreya Udhav

12) Sinhgad Dental College, Pune - Amount of penalty to be paid by the institute – Rs. 7,00,00,000/-

Sr. No.	Name of the Student illegally /Wrongly admitted
1.	Shreya Shrinivas
2.	Joshi Riddhi Shripad
3.	Bansali Aishwariya Suresh
4.	Purohit Subodh Subhash
5.	Kabra Paritosh Manish

7W

Sr. No.	Name of the Student illegally /Wrongly admitted
6.	Jain Ruchita Suresh
7.	Sing Devendrapratap Mrutunjay
8.	Dodal Shreya Gautam
9.	Bagli Madhujay Sanjay
10.	Hole Ponam Datatray
11.	Gogare Pratiksha Balasaheb
12.	Chankeshwara Sonia Rajesh
13.	Kalavankar Shravani Suhas
14.	Maral Sayali Anil
15.	Katkar Pallavi Nandkumar
16.	Agarwal Nidhi vinod
17.	Salunkhe Shreya Vivek
18.	Raisoni Prasanna Umakant
19.	Satav Aishwariya Satish
20.	Khrisagar Swarupa Nitin
21.	Jadhav Anuja Pradip
22.	Chandak Shruti Bharat
23.	Jain Shweta Dineshkumar
24.	Jain Chitra Bagavatilal
25.	Bhosle Sayee Shirish
26.	Mahajan Shubham Shivkumar
27.	Monin Daraksha Abdul Baseed
28.	Gurav Kashmir Milind
29.	Chavan Pratibha Ankushrao
30.	Charke Rohit Bhaskarrao
31.	Patil Dipali Raju
32.	Rokade Rohini Suresh
33.	Gir Rushikesh Jayprakash
34.	Patil Prashant Vikas
35.	Salunkhe Swapnil Rajendra

gw

13) K.B.H. M.G.V. Dental College, Nashik - Amount of penalty to be paid by the institute – Rs. 3,20,00,000/-

Sr. No.	Name of the Student illegally /Wrongly admitted
1.	Patel Riddhi Navneet
2.	Latpate Rupali Laxmanrao
3.	Kabra Ruchita Jayant
4.	Shruti Saisubramanian
5.	Hundiwale Prachi Sanjay
6.	Raut Diksha Dilip
7.	Hirani Harsha Rajesh
8.	Pawar Shivaani Rohidas
9.	Maliwal Varnda Santosh
10.	Sarkar Ipsita Ajoy
11.	Bhavsar Shalvi Sachin
12.	Jadhav Shivani Prakash
13.	Jadhav Pranita Sanjay
14.	Baheti Akansha Sunil
15.	Lohiya Geetanjali Radheshyam
16.	Kushare Rishikesh Ramdas

The amount of penalty shall be paid by these Institutions within a period of four weeks from the date of publication of these minutes on the official website of the Samiti. The Health University has already been requested by a resolution dated 15th September, 2015 to withhold the affiliation of these Colleges / Institutions from the Academic Year 2016-17 until the resolution of the Samiti is complied with by them. A copy of the resolution should also be sent to the Director of Medical Education & Research and State Government for appropriate actions in this regards.

The amount of penalty paid by these Institutions should be forwarded to the State Government. Samiti feels it appropriate in this regard that at least a part of the amount so forwarded is utilized for the drought relief work. Government may consider the feelings of the Samiti.

Office to communicate all the concerned accordingly.

sw

Item No. 5: To consider and decide the explanations submitted by the Colleges/Institutes in respect of the complaints/representations submitted by the Students/parents during admission process conducted at Institute level for the Academic Year 2015-16.

Samiti perused the complaints/representations received during the admission process – Academic Year 2014-15. Samiti also perused replies there on submitted by the respective Colleges/Institutes.

1) Pad. Dr. Vitthalrao Vikhe Patil Medical College, Ahmednagar

- a) Name of the Complainant : Ms. Shreya Fapat
- Nature of complaint : College denied admission to applicant, because Original certificates were not produced.
- Contention of College : College vide its letters dated 28/09/2015 and 29/09/2015 stated that the said candidate did not submit his original documents at the time of admissions.
- Decision of the Samiti : Considering the submission of the college, case is disposed off accordingly.
- b) Name of the Complainant : Mr. Saurabh Dnyaneshwar Walunj
- Nature of complaint : College denied admission to applicant, because Original certificates were not produced.
- Contention of College : College vide its letter dated 28/09/2015 stated that the said candidate did not submit his original documents at the time of admission.
- Decision of the Samiti : Considering the submission of the college, case is disposed off accordingly.

2) A.C.P.M. Medical College, Dhule

- a) Name of the Complainant : Shaikh Aayesha Bano
- Nature of complaint : Her application was not acknowledged.
- Contention of College : College vide its letter dated 26/09/2015 stated that the application of the said candidate was received on 23/09/2015 and last date of submission of application was 22/09/2015.
- Decision of the Samiti : Considering the submission of the college, case is disposed off accordingly.

3) S.M.B.T. Medical College, Nashik

- a) Name of the Complainant : Ku. Rutuja Shivesing Rajput
- Nature of complaint : Her name was selected in selection list of vacancy round conducted by the aforesaid College/Institute, but college cancelled her admission.
- Decision of the Samiti : Samiti directs to the aforesaid College/Institute to submit its say on the said complaint. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration.

Item No. 6: Letter dated 21st September 2015 received from C.S.M.S.S. Ayurved College, Aurangabad asking permission to admit students from other than APGA-CET-2015 for the Post Graduate Ayurved Courses for the Academic Year 2015-16.

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from C.S.M.S.S.s. Ayurved College, Aurangabad asking permission to admit students from other than APGA-CET-2015 for the Post Graduate Ayurved Courses for the Academic Year 2015-16.

After deliberations, Samiti accedes to the request made by college to admit the students from other CET i.e. PGA-CET-2015 conducted by the Directorate of AYUSH, M.S. for the admissions of Post Graduate Ayurved Courses for the Academic Year 2015-16. Samiti further decides that the approval of such admitted students will be given only after submitting sufficient evidence as to the list of qualified students in APGA-CET-2015 having been exhausted fully for Academic Year 2015-16 for Post Graduate Ayurved courses by the Competent authority, Association of Management of Ayurvedic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra before the admission. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 7: To review - admissions in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2012-13, 2013-14 and 2014-15. (Ref.: As per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 25th October 2013 (at Item No. 9[a]).

Item No. 7(a): To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.

And

Item No. 7(b): To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.

Samiti decides to consider the matter in the next meeting.

g

Item No.8: **To consider and decide on the following matters with the permission of the Chair.**

Item No. 8(a): **Letter dated 1st October 2015 received from MAEER's Physiotherapy College, Pune regarding admission of M.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2015-16.**

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from MAEER's Physiotherapy College, Pune asking permission to admit students on the basis of Non-CET or conduct Institute - level CET for the admissions of vacant seats of Post Graduate Physiotherapy course for the Academic Year 2015-16.

Samiti concludes that the aspect of granting permission to selected candidates on the basis of Non CET does not come within the purview of Samiti.


Samiti observes that the aforesaid College has opted for the admissions process conducted by Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai on the basis of results of PGP-CET-2015 for M.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2015-16.

After deliberations, Samiti directs the Competent Authority, Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State to submit sufficient evidence as to whether the list of qualified students in PGP-CET-2015 has been exhausted fully for Academic Year 2015-16 for Post Graduate Physiotherapy course. After receipt of the same, it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

- (b) Samiti after deliberations, decides to pay T.A./D.A., allowances and honorarium to Special Invitee - Mr. P.E. Gaikwad, Ex. Office Secretary, Pravesh Niyrantr Samiti, Maharashtra State from the Samiti's fund, whenever his services are utilized for samiti's work and for attending the Samiti meetings. Office to take necessary steps.

Next meeting of Pravesh Niyrantr Samiti (Medical Education) will be held on **Friday, the 6th November, 2015** at 3:30 p.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre of Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai - 400 001.

Date: 30 OCT 2015


(D.K. DESHMUKH)
CHAIRMAN

